# COMBATING RADICALISM IN PAKISTAN
## EDUCATIONAL REFORM AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

Allison Baer

*The Project on International Peace and Security*
The College of William and Mary

*The Project on International Peace and Security (PIPS) at the College of William and Mary is a highly selective undergraduate think tank designed to bridge the gap between the academic and policy communities in the area of undergraduate education. The goal of PIPS is to demonstrate that elite students, working with faculty and members of the policy community, can make a meaningful contribution to policy debates. The following brief is a testament to that mission and the talent and creativity of William and Mary's undergraduates.*

Amy Oakes, Director
Dennis A. Smith, Director

The Project on International Peace and Security
The Institute for Theory and Practice of International Relations
Department of Government
The College of William and Mary
P.O. Box 8795
Williamsburg, VA 23187-8795
757.221.5086
pips@wm.edu

**Abstract**

Pakistan's dysfunctional education system is a major contributor to continuing radicalization that undermines the country's political and economic stability. Previous top-down efforts to reform the education system have met with little success, largely because of Pakistani government corruption or program inefficiency.

This brief proposes that the United States lead the international community in supporting a grassroots initiative to reform Pakistan's education system. Working through a non-profit Pakistani NGO, The Citizens Foundation (TCF), the international community should combine internet resources with traditional education infrastructure to empower the reform efforts of moderates. This approach would involve: (1) further development of TCF curricula and teacher training programs; (2) creation of a free internet-based database in which TCF's curricula and training programs would be available; and (3) construction of urban education centers—similar to former United States Information Agency Libraries and Information Resource Centers—in Pakistan. The aim is to provide moderates with the training and material support necessary to establish better public schools, reform the education system, and reduce radicalization in Pakistan.

## The Radicalization of Pakistan

A sizeable minority of Pakistani citizens support radical Islamic movements such as al-Qaeda, the Afghan Taliban, and Tehrik-i-Taliban. Moreover, backing for radical groups also has increased in the military.[1]

- In 2011, there were almost 2,000 terrorist attacks in Pakistan, in addition to 301 clashes between security forces and militants.[2]

- In May 2011, 12% of Pakistanis said they view al-Qaeda favorably. Over 15% of Pakistanis support the Afghan and Tehrik-i-Taliban and 27% support the anti-India Islamic group Lashkar-e-Taiba.[3]

- General Ashfaq Kayani, Pakistan's Chief of Army Staff, did not condemn the recent murder of the Governor of Punjab and prominent social liberal, Salman Taseer. Amhed Rashid, a well-known Pakistani journalist, stated that the General declined to comment because "too many soldiers in the ranks…sympathize with the killer…[and] any public statement…could endanger the army's unity."[4]

## Radicalization and Pakistan's Public Education System

Pakistan's struggling public education system is a major contributor to radicalization.[5] Public schools use radical curricula, receive inadequate funding, and do not prepare students for the

workforce. Professor Tariq Rahman of Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, stated that students "succeed in spite of the [education] system not because of it."[6] As a result, undereducated or unemployed Pakistanis turn to extremist organizations that promise societal and economic change.[7]

- *Radical Content of Curricula*: Rubina Saigol, a Pakistani academic studying public school textbooks, found that "a great deal of the ideology that we think madrassas are producing is in fact being produced in state schools."[8] Public school curricula teach that Islam and Pakistan are in danger and that the Pakistani people are at war with the West.[9] Thus, 30% of undergraduates surveyed in 2010 ranked the United States as the largest threat to Pakistan.[10]

- *Underfunded Education System*: Ahmed Rashid reported that in Pakistan "social services, especially education, remain abysmal, because every year the government's spending on…education is cut."[11] Because the Pakistani government allocates less than 3% of GDP to education, Pakistan was ranked 142 out of 163 countries for percentage of GDP spent on education in 2009.[12] Consequently, 20,000 schools lack sufficient facilities; others are over-crowded or are non-existent "ghost schools."[13] 66% of parents identified "non-availability" of schools as the reason why their child was not enrolled.[14] The student-to-teacher ratio in primary schools is 40:1 and teachers earn as little as $50 per month.[15]

- *Lack of Job Training*: A 2007 UNESCO report asserted that Pakistan needs to "re-conceptualize the role of technical and vocational education and to link it to primary and secondary education."[16] Professor Khadim Hussain of Pakistan's Bahria University stated that students "don't understand what evidence is" and that many are taught that using "logic means that you are definitely an agent of India."[17] Having few vocational or analytical skills leaves students susceptible to radical propaganda and unprepared for the job market.

**Radicalization and Pakistan's Madrassas**

Six percent of Pakistani students attend private Islamic schools, called madrassas, largely because they are closer, lower cost, or have better resources than public schools. Other students attend madrassas because their parents prefer they receive a religious education.[18] However, madrassas use archaic curricula that do not provide vocational skills and some madrassas directly recruit students for terrorist operations.

- *Impractical and Outdated Curricula*: Christine Fair, an Assistant Professor at Georgetown University, notes that the Pakistani government would like "madrassas

students to be more employable."[19] Half of madrassas' standardized curricula are religious studies. The remaining content is the "rational sciences," including math, medicine, astronomy, history, philosophy, polemics, and prosody. The most recent texts in the rational sciences curricula date to the 14th century.[20]

- *Militant Recruitment*: Tariq Rahman asserts that "the *madrassa* are the most intolerant of all other student groups in Pakistan."[21] Approximately 23% of Pakistani militants have attended a madrassa, and 13% were recruited at their madrassa.[22]

Pakistan's public education system lacks funding and appropriate curricula. Madrassas fail to prepare students for the global economy or themselves recruit students for militant organizations. Therefore, education reform is necessary to counter the spread of radicalism in Pakistan.


**Past Attempts to Reform Pakistan's Education System**

The Pakistani government, the international community, and the United States recognize the connection between the country's failing education system and radicalization. In response, they have implemented a variety of reform initiatives.


Domestic Reform Initiatives

Pakistan's national and provincial governments have attempted multiple reforms, such as the Education Sector Reforms and the establishment of the Punjab Education Foundation.

- The *Education Sector Reforms* (ESR) were begun by the Ministry of Education in 2001 as part of the international Education for All initiative. ESR targeted school availability, institutional reforms, vocational and technical training, education quality, and the integration of private schools into the public system.[23]

- The *Punjab Education Foundation*, funded by Punjab's provincial government, provides free private schooling to students. Current enrollment is estimated at 600,000.[24]

*Assessment*: Political divisions in Pakistan greatly hinder national education reforms, such as ESR. For instance, conservatives have vehemently opposed the ESR goals of integrating madrassas and revising the national curricula.[25] Successful provincial reforms, such as the Punjab Education Foundation, are not standardized throughout Pakistan, limiting their effectiveness.[26]

International Education Initiatives

The international community gives both bilateral and multilateral education aid to Pakistan. Two prominent multilateral efforts are the World Bank's Education for All initiative and the United Nations' World Food Program.

- *Education for All* is an initiative that seeks to improve access to high quality education, lessen gender disparities, and improve adult literacy.[27]

- The *United Nations World Food Program* provides food to students and rations to families in order to improve women's education, enrollment, and performance levels.[28]

*Assessment*: Most international aid projects underperform because Pakistan's education bureaucracy is corrupt and underfunded or the program allocates resources inefficiently.[29] The Education for All Global Monitoring Report noted that Pakistan has made "slower progress" in increasing enrollment than other participants.[30] The World Food Program has also experienced difficulties: providing food to some schools has caused students already enrolled elsewhere to switch schools, but has not increased total student enrollment in the country.[31]

U.S. Education Initiatives

The United States provides $200 million annually to Pakistan in education aid.[32] USAID supervises five initiatives: Links to Learning, Children's Television Project, Fulbright Scholarship Program, Teachers Education Program, and Higher Education Commission Support.

- *Links to Learning* improves achievement in English, science, math, and computer literacy by increasing teacher training and education infrastructure.[33]

- *Children's Television Project* uses television and other media to develop language, problem-solving, and critical thinking skills.[34]

- *Fulbright Scholarship Program* increases the number of Pakistanis qualified to be leaders in education, society, politics, and business by providing scholarships to elite Pakistani students pursuing graduate degrees in the United States.[35]

- *Teachers Education Program* works with Pakistani universities, training programs, and education departments to better educate and train Pakistani teachers.[36]

- *Higher Education Commission Support* is developing financial aid programs with 11 universities and the Higher Education Commission in Pakistan. The program helps institutions establish permanent financial aid programs, scholarships, and relations with international institutions. It also funds students affected by the 2010 floods.[37]

*Assessment*: U.S. education aid is ineffective because of Pakistani government corruption, a lack of U.S. oversight, and Pakistani resistance to secular education.[38] Of the $1.5 billion given to Pakistan under the Enhanced Partnership with Pakistan Act (EPPA) in 2010, only $180 million was properly allocated.[39] In addition, a 2008 report from the Brookings Institution found that Pakistanis view U.S. attempts to "secularize" curricula as invasive.[40]

## Demand for Education Revitalization by Pakistani Citizens

Pakistanis are frustrated with extremist violence and believe it to be increasingly detrimental to the state.

- 63% of Pakistanis fear Islamic extremism because it produces violence, has a negative impact on the economy, increases division in the country, and results in loss of civil liberties.[41]

- Following Osama bin Laden's death, 60% of Punjabis fear that extremists may seize control of Pakistan and 56% consider extremists a "serious threat" to Pakistan.[42]

Pakistani citizens are combating radicalization through multiple grassroots initiatives, several of which work to increase the availability and quality of education.

- Dar ul Uloom Ashraf al-Madrassas Okara, a school in Okara, Pakistan, is re-educating radical youths and developing non-radical curricula. Specifically, the school promotes a peaceful understanding of *jihad* and emphasizes the concept of peace in the Koran.[43]

- The 2011 UNESCO Education for All report states that "NGOs [in Pakistan] have established 'satellite schools' in consultation with community leaders in areas where government schools have been destroyed by the Taliban."[44]

- In Abbottabad, citizens want the government to establish a women's college on land that was previously part of bin Laden's compound.[45]

**Using Information Technology and Improved Infrastructure to Revitalize Education**

Pakistani citizens increasingly recognize the importance of education for reducing extremism. In light of the failure of previous reform efforts, citizens are developing their own grassroots initiatives to improve education. The Arab Spring has demonstrated that grassroots movements in non-Western countries benefit from internet access, as it allows for widespread information sharing and communication. Therefore, the United States should lead a multilateral effort to: (1) support a moderate grassroots organization in Pakistan, The Citizens Foundation; (2) provide digital education resources and; (3) improve internet and education infrastructure in Pakistan.

Benefits of Expanding The Citizens Foundation

TCF's presence and success in multiple regions of Pakistan makes it well-positioned to lead and coordinate grassroots reform efforts.

- *Record of Success in Pakistan*: TCF runs 730 schools in over 80 towns and cities. Its current enrollment is over 100,000 students, nearly half of whom are female.[46]

- *Community Involvement*: Upon entering a community, TCF establishes positive relationships with reluctant community members, making it popular among Pakistanis.[47]

- *International Branches*: TCF has fundraising branches in the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada, the United Arab Emirates, and Bahrain.[48]

- *Fundraising Capabilities*: TCF funds all infrastructure and operating costs through tuition and private donations from individuals or corporations.[49]

- *Moderate Curricula*: TCF's curricula combine national education goals with international curricula to achieve the "personal and moral development" of students.[50]

- *Successful Training of Employees*: TCF's training program provides pre-service and in-service training for teachers. Its training team regularly updates the training manual.[51]

Because of its popularity within Pakistan and existing international infrastructure, TCF has the resources and expertise necessary to lead a grassroots education revitalization project. Thus, the United States should encourage countries with international branches of TCF to assist with and fund the establishment of an education database and education centers.

<u>Education Database</u>

The education database will supply TCF curricula and training resources to teachers, students, and citizens, regardless of school affiliation or location.[52] Database resources will include:

- *School Curricula*: The database will offer online access to TCF textbooks, activities, labs, assignments, and exams.

- *Continuing Education Courses and Curricula*: The database will provide online courses for Pakistani adults interested in improving their education. Importantly, it will also provide curricula that will assist Pakistani educators interested in teaching adult education courses.

- *Teacher Training Resources*: The database will include TCF recommended resources on teaching strategies and classroom management. There will also be information about higher education programs, further teacher training opportunities, foreign exchange programs, and scholarships.

<u>Education Centers</u>

Education centers will be located throughout Pakistan, primarily in urban areas to ensure access for the largest number of citizens. Each center will be equipped with the following:
- *Computer Lab*: Each computer lab will be open to the public and will have free internet access. Computers will require log-in for use, allowing TCF employees to detect any usage by radicals.  All computers will have desktop links to the education database, as well as reputable news sites. Computer labs will have a printer and photocopier to facilitate the distribution of free educational materials.

- *Library*: The libraries will have copies of textbooks available on the education database, subscriptions to newspapers, journals, and magazines, and copies of both Pakistani and foreign books. Libraries will be a space for academic study and research and will loan materials to registered citizens.

- *Lecture Hall or Classroom*: Each center will provide a lecture hall or classroom for use by the public schools, or for teacher training sessions, adult-education courses, public meetings, and lectures—either in person or via teleconference—by academics and specialists.

**Advantages of TCF Education Database and Education Centers**


Advantage #1: Reduces Radicalization and Empowers Moderate Education Reform Efforts

- *Competition for Madrassas*: Education centers will help lessen the appeal of madrassas by giving public school teachers access to additional resources.

- *Moderate Islamic Curricula*: TCF curricula will be an alternative to unpopular secular curricula and curricula currently taught in public schools and madrassas. The database curricula will allow educators to both please parents and eliminate radical messages from the classroom.[53]

- *Teacher Training*: Teachers will be able to continue their own education by using training resources available online and in the education centers, improving the quality of educators throughout Pakistan.

- *Continuing Adult Education*: Education centers will hold adult education courses and the database will provide online classes for adults. Increasing overall education in the country will lead to greater economic opportunities and lessen the appeal of radicalism.

- *Research*: Education centers will provide access to the internet, which will allow Pakistanis to research topics of interest, making them better informed and therefore less susceptible radical propaganda.


Advantage #2: Reduces Radicalization through Increased Employment

- *TCF Employees*: TCF will hire local Pakistanis, especially women, to run and maintain the education centers and database. In addition, TCF will hire Pakistanis to work as security guards for education centers.

- *Career Advancement*: Pakistanis will be able to attend education center classes and use center computers for vocational training, improving their credentials and ability to find a job.

Advantage #3: Universal Access to Database and Improved Internet Infrastructure

- *Database Access*: The education database will provide educational resources to teachers and students who have internet access, but are unable to visit an education center.

- *Internet Infrastructure*: Education centers will increase internet access in urban areas by providing such access free of charge.

Advantage #4: Pakistani Citizen Involvement

- *Project Evaluation*: Pakistanis working in an education center will report on the success of the center and the usefulness of the database. They will monitor local enthusiasm for the project and provide suggestions for improvement.

- *Resource Suggestions*: Pakistanis will be able to suggest new materials that should be added to the database or stocked in education center library collections, increasing the likelihood that the resources will be useful to the population.

Advantage #5: Minimal Involvement of the Pakistani Government

- *Implementation*: TCF is legally registered in Pakistan as a private company and is able to receive international donations.[54] Therefore, the Pakistani government will be less able or likely to block implementation or insist on government oversight.

- *Funding*: Foreign governments, international donors, and citizens will fund the aid initiative. It will not rely on Pakistani government funding and will thus avoid diverting funds from national education programs or losing funds due to government corruption.

**Possible Objections**

Objection #1: Education Center Internet Access Will Further Spread Radical Propaganda

- Radical groups could use improved internet access to disseminate more propaganda, recruit followers, and coordinate attacks in Pakistan.[55]

- The internet allows radicals to recruit and build relationships with individuals outside of Pakistan.[56]

*Response*: Education centers will be able to monitor computer use and prevent center computers from being used to circulate radical propaganda.

Objection #2: Militants Will Target Education Centers

- In October 2009, two suicide attacks were carried out at the International Islamic University, killing at least six people. The day after the attacks, schools throughout the country were closed due to safety concerns.[57]

*Response*: TCF hires guards and gatekeepers for their schools to guarantee their safety.[58] Some TCF schools are also located inside army compounds to ensure security.[59] The education centers will make use of the expertise and successful system of TCF to guarantee security. The database will provide educational resources to areas that TCF judges too dangerous for a center.

Objection #3: Pakistanis' Distrust of the United States

- Pakistanis may view an education reform initiative led by the United States as imperialist.[60]

- Pakistanis currently resent U.S. aid because it has traditionally focused on the military, while the population lacks essential government services.[61]

*Response*: First, basing the education database content on TCF curricula and teacher training programs will reduce accusations of imperialism. Second, since the program will support an existing internal movement for better education, Pakistanis may be more receptive.[62] The international community will be clear that is providing the support that moderates have requested.[63] Finally, the program will be more popular than other aid initiatives because it will focus on the long-term development of Pakistan, as opposed to short-term U.S. military or strategic goals.

Objection #4: Opposition from the Pakistani Government or Military

A 2011 Congressional Research Service Report highlights reactions by Pakistani officials and military officers to the EPPA:

- The report describes officials as "highly critical of the EPPA, seeing in its language an intent to interfere with and dictate to Pakistan on sensitive foreign policy and national security issues, perhaps even with malicious goals."[64]

- In addition, the Pakistani military expressed "serious concern regarding clauses [of the law] impacting on national security."[65]

*Response*: Working with TCF will diminish Pakistani government involvement and interference because TCF is already registered as a business and legally operating in Pakistan. In addition, TCF's mechanism to receive funds from international branches is already in place and requires no further involvement of the Pakistani government.[66] Finally, implementation of the project does not require concessions from the civilian government or military.

Objection #5: Reluctance of the U.S. Government

- Current U.S.-Pakistan relations have been increasingly strained since the Abbottabad raid in May 2011. More investment in Pakistan may not be seen as worthwhile at present.[67]

- The United States has already committed to giving Pakistan $7.5 billion in non-military aid under the EPPA; it may be hesitant to use further funds during an economic recession.[68]

- The United States dislikes funding multilateral organizations or leading multilateral efforts.[69]

- The U.S. Congress may be hesitant to fund a program that integrates religion and education.

*Response*: First, expanding TCF will benefit U.S.-Pakistan relations, as Pakistanis may become more cooperative once they have received aid that successfully benefits the populace. And, since TCF is able to build and operate a school for a year for less than $90,000, this proposal will be a comparatively low-cost method for improving relations with

Pakistan.[70] Second, the United States has previously funded religious education in other countries.[71] In addition, a 2003 report by the USAID Bureau for Policy and Program Coordination recommended that, to improve education in Islamic countries, USAID should support moderate Islamic education initiatives, in addition to secular efforts.[72]

## Conclusion

Radicals are a threat to the stability of the international community, the security of Pakistan's nuclear arsenal, and U.S. forces in the region. Reforming the education system will decrease Pakistani support of radicals, but government corruption, a lack of coordination, program inefficiency, and misguided objectives have impeded past and current reform efforts.

International funding of TCF to create an education database and establish education centers will empower moderate Pakistanis, improve the quality of public education, and reduce the appeal of madrassas. The initiative will provide the moderate majority of Pakistanis with the resources they need to reform the education system from the bottom up. Public schools will benefit from physical infrastructure, modern curricula, and better trained teachers. As the quality of public schools increases, enrollment in madrassas will decrease. Thus, a better educated Pakistani populace, less prone to radicalization, and with better prospects for employment, will emerge, improving domestic stability and regional stability, and U.S.-Pakistan relations.

---

[1] Fareed Zakaria, "The Radicalization of Pakistan's military," *The Washington Post*, June 22, 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/the-radicalization-of-pakistans-military/2011/06/22/AGbCBSgH_story.html.

[2] Pak Institute for Peace Studies, *Pakistan Security Report 2011* (Islamabad: Pak Institute for Peace Studies, January 2012), 5, http://san-pips.com/.

[3] Pew Research Center, *Support for Campaign against Extremists Wanes: U.S. Image in Pakistan Falls No Further Following bin Laden Killing* (Washington, DC: Pew Global Attitudes Project, June 21, 2011), http://www.pewglobal.org/2011/06/21/u-s-image-in-pakistan-falls-no-further-following-bin-laden-killing/.

[4] Ahmed Rashid, "An Army without a Country," *New York Review Blog*, The New York Times Review of Books, March 4, 2011, http://www.nybooks.com/blogs/nyrblog/2011/mar/04/army-without-country/.

[5] UNESCO Education for All, *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2011: The Hidden Crisis: Armed Conflict and Education* (Paris: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 2011), 262, 265, http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0019/001907/190743e.pdf.
A 2011 UNESCO report ranked Pakistan's education system 119 out of 127 countries. The rankings are based on primary enrollment, adult literacy, gender equality, and quality of education through grade 5.

[6] Tariq Rahman, "The Educational Caste System: A Survey of Schooling and Polarization in Pakistan," *tariqrahman.net*, http://www.tariqrahman.net/educa/DENIZENS%20OF%20ALIEN%20WORLDS%20Amended.htm.

[7] Muhammad Azam, "Radicalization in Pakistan: Sociocultural Realities," *Conflict and Peace Studies* 2, no. 1 (January-March 2009): 10, http://san-pips.com/download.php?f=06.pdf.
C. Christine Fair, "The Educated Militants of Pakistan: Implications for Pakistan's Domestic Security," *Contemporary South Asia* 16, no. 1 (March 2008): 100-101, http://home.comcast.net/~christine_fair/pubs/Fair_CSA_2008.pdf.

Given that 58% of militants completed a secondary level of education, a large percentage, one-quarter, were unemployed or underemployed in the year before they were recruited.

[8] *Pakistan: The Lost Generation*, Documentary, directed by David Montero, (PBS Frontline World, February 12, 2010), http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/pakistan901/video_index.html.

[9] PBS, "Pakistan: The Lost Generation: Story Synopsis," *Frontline World: Stories from a Small Planet*, http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/pakistan901/video_index.html.

[10] Pak Institute for Peace Studies, *Radicalization: Perceptions of Educated Youth in Pakistan* (Islamabad, Pak Institute for Peace Studies, September 20, 2010), 11, http://san-pips.com/download.php?f=45.pdf.

[11] Ahmed Rashid, *Pakistan on the Brink: The Future of America, Pakistan, and Afghanistan* (New York: Viking, 2012), 32.

[12] UNESCO, *Education (All Levels) Profile-Pakistan*, UIS Statistics in Brief (Paris: United Nations Educational, Social and Cultural Organization Institute for Statistics, 2011), 3, http://stats.uis.unesco.org/unesco/TableViewer/document.aspx?ReportId=289&IF_Language=eng&BR_Country=5860&BR_Region=40535.

U.S. Central Intelligence Agency, *The World Factbook: Country Comparison, Education Expenditures* (Washington, DC: CIA), https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/rankorder/2206rank.html.

[13] Montero, *Pakistan: The Lost Generation*.

PBS, "Pakistan: The Lost Generation: Story Synopsis."

Sixty percent of Pakistani schools have no electricity; forty percent have no available drinking water.

[14] UNESCO, *Education (All Levels) Profile-Pakistan.*

Masooda Bano, *Education for All by 2015: Will We Make It? Pakistan: Country Case Study*, Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2008 (Paris: United Nations Educational, Social and Cultural Organization, 2007), 23, http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0015/001555/155503e.pdf.

[15] Griff Witte, "Poor Schooling Slows Anti-Terrorism Effort in Pakistan," *The Washington Post*, January 17, 2010, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2010/01/16/AR2010011602660.html.

The wages of some teachers in Pakistan are lower than that of domestic servants.

[16] Bano, *Education for All by 2015*, 32.

UNESCO, *World Data on Education: Pakistan*, 7th ed. (Paris: United Nations Educational, Social and Cultural Organization International Bureau of Education, 2010-2011), 21, http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002113/211310e.pdf.

In addition, a 2011 UNESCO assessment reported that Pakistani students "were found weak in the competencies/skills of writing and comprehension in languages, problem-solving and sums involving use of currency and conversion in the subject of mathematics, and life skills knowledge in the subjects of science/general knowledge."

[17] Witte, "Poor Schooling Slows."

[18] Mumtaz Ahmad, "Madrassa Education in Pakistan and Bangladesh," in *Religious Radicalism and Security in South Asia*, eds. Satu P. Limaye, Mohan Malik, and Robert G. Wirsing (Honolulu, Hawaii: Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies, 2004), 108, http://www.apcss.org/Publications/Edited%20Volumes/ReligiousRadicalism/PagesfromReligiousRadicalismandSecurityinSouthAsiach5.pdf.

Declan Walsh, "Pakistan Schools Campaign Hopes to Avert 'Education Emergency,' British-backed Initiative Aims to Help Overhaul a System that Has Left Seven Million Children without Primary Education," *The Guardian*, March 8, 2011, http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/mar/08/pakistan-faces-education-emergency.

UNESCO Education for All, *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2011*, 195.

[19] C. Christine Fair, *Islamic Education in Pakistan* (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace, March 2006), 7, http://home.comcast.net/~christine_fair/pubs/trip_report.pdf.

[20] Ibid., 3.

[21] Rahman, "The Educational Caste System."

[22] Fair, "The Educated Militants of Pakistan," 100.

Taimoor Shah and Alissa J. Rubin, "2 Boys with Suicide Vests Are Arrested in Afghanistan," *The New York Times*, February, 12, 2012, 1, www.nytimes.com/2012/02/13/world/asia/2-boys-with-suicide-vests-are-arrested-in-afghanistan.html.

Pakistani madrassas are also known to recruit children for suicide missions in Afghanistan. In February 2012, a 12-year-old boy who attended a madrassa in Quetta reported that his teachers said, "You won't be hurt; just go and carry out a suicide attack."

[23] Government of Pakistan Ministry of Education, *Education Sector Reforms: Action Plan 2001-02 - 2005-2006* (March 2004), 9, 13-14, http://www.moe.gov.pk/esr/Chap2.pdf.

[24] Sir Michael Barber, "Education Reform in Pakistan: This Time It's Going to Be Different," *Pakistan Education Task Force* (June 2010), 5, http://pakistaneducationtaskforce.com/erp.pdf.

[25] K. Alan Kronstadt, *Education Reform in Pakistan* (Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, December 23, 2004), 6, http://www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/crs/rs22009.pdf.

[26] Barber, "Education Reform in Pakistan," 5.

[27] The World Bank, "Education for All (EFA): What is Education for All (EFA)?" *Education: Human Development Network*, http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTEDUCATION/0,,contentMDK:20374062~menuPK:540090~pagePK:148956~piPK:216618~theSitePK:282386,00.html.

[28] Touseef Ahmed and others, "Food for Education Improves Girls' Education: The Pakistan Girls' Education Programme," *School & Health* (March 9, 2007), 3-4, http://www.schoolsandhealth.org/sites/ffe/Key%20Information/Food%20for%20Education%20Improves%20Girls%E2%80%99%20Education__Tshe%20Pakistan%20Girls%E2%80%99%20Education%20Programme.pdf.
United Nations, "Pakistan: WFP Activities," *World Food Programme*, http://www.wfp.org/countries/Pakistan/Operations.

[29] Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, *Educating the Pakistani Masses: The World Needs to Help, Combating Terrorism through Education: The Near East and South Asian Experience: Shahid Javed Burki*, 111th Cong., 1st session, April 19, 2009, 9, http://www.foreign.senate.gov/imo/media/doc/BurkiTestimony050419.pdf.
Shahid Javed Burki's testimony described Pakistan's education bureaucracy as "corrupt, inefficient and dysfunctional" and cited it as a cause of failed international aid efforts.

[30] UNESCO Education for All, *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2011*, 42.

[31] World Food Programme, *Case Study: Pakistan-Girls' Education on the Frontline*, Learning from Experience: Case Studies (Rome, Italy: United Nations World Food Programme), 3-4, http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/newsroom/wfp207493.pdf.

[32] Witte, "Poor Schooling Slows."

[33] USAID, "Links to Learning: Education Support to Pakistan (ED-LINKS)," *USAID/Pakistan*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/sectors/education/edlinks.html.

[34] USAID, "Education: Children's Television Project," *USAID/Pakistan*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/db/sectors/education/project_33.html.

[35] USAID, "Education Overall Fact Sheet," *USAID/Pakistan: Fact Sheets*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/sectors/education/docs/ed_factsheet.pdf.
USAID, "USAID-Fulbright Scholarship Program," *USAID/Pakistan*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/sectors/education/ufs.html.

[36] USAID, "News Release: U.S. Supports Teacher Education Reforms in Pakistan," *USAID/Pakistan*, July 6, 2011, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/newsroom/news/education/110706.html.
USAID, "Higher Education Commission – Financial Aid Development (HEC-FAD) Program," *USAID/Pakistan*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/sectors/education/hecfad.html.

[37] USAID, "Education: Higher Education Commission Support – University Development," *USAID/Pakistan*, http://www.usaid.gov/pk/db/sectors/education/project_2.html.

[38] Susan B. Epstein and K. Alan Kronstadt, *Pakistan: U.S. Foreign Assistance* (Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, June 7, 2011), 27, http://fpc.state.gov/documents/organization/166839.pdf.
A 2011 CRS report on U.S. foreign assistance to Pakistan stated that U.S. programs suffer from corruption and need more U.S. oversight.

[39] U.S. Government Accountability Office, *Department of State's Report to Congress and U.S. Oversight of Civilian Assistance to Pakistan Can be Further Enhanced*, (Washington, DC: United States Government Accountability Office, February 17, 2011), 8, http://www.gao.gov/assets/100/97299.pdf.

[40] Moeed Yusuf, *Prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan: Implications for U.S. Policy*, The Brookings Project on U.S. Relations with the Islamic World, Analysis Paper 14 (Washington, DC: The Brookings Institute, October 2008), 20, http://www.brookings.edu/~/media/Files/rc/papers/2008/10_pakistan_yusuf/10_pakistan_yusuf.pdf.

[41] Pew Research Center, *Support for Campaign.*

[42] Ibid.

[43] Mehreen Farooq and Waleed Ziad, "The Battle for Pakistan's Soul," *Foreign Policy: The AfPak Channel* (September 1, 2011), http://afpak.foreignpolicy.com/posts/2011/09/01/the_battle_for_pakistans_soul.

[44] UNESCO Education for All, *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2011*, 224.

[45] Muhammad Sadaqat, "Residents Want Girls College Built on Ruins of OBL Compound," *The Express Tribune*, February 28, 2012, http://tribune.com.pk/story/342810/residents-want-girls-college-built-on-ruins-of-obl-compound/.
Citizens of Abbottabad argue that "our daughters, the future mothers, will disseminate the message of peace and non-violence across the area, if the authorities allow construction of a girls college."

[46] The Citizens Foundation, "Milestones," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/Milestones.aspx.

[47] Ashan Saleem, "Against the Tide: Role of The Citizens Foundation in Pakistani Education," in *Education Reform in Pakistan: Building for the Future*, ed. Robert M. Hathaway, (Washington, DC: Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars Asia Program, 2005), 79, http://www.wilsoncenter.org/sites/default/files/FinalPDF.pdf.
Marie Lall, *Creating Agents of Positive Change-The Citizens Foundation in Pakistan* (Karachi, PAK: The Citizens Foundation, Autumn 2008), 36,
http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/ePanel/Resources/DownloadFiles/Publications/Category/8/36/Marie%20Lall%20Report.pdf.
A 2008 report by Dr. Marie Lall of the University of London found that "parents across the board wanted to see more TCF schools," indicating the popularity of the Foundation in Pakistan.

[48] The Citizens Foundation, "TCF Supporters," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/Supporters.aspx.

[49] Saleem, "Against the Tide," 71-72.
TCF schools cost roughly $70,000 to build and $13,000 in annual operations' costs.

[50] The Citizens Foundation, "Curricula," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/Curricula.aspx.

[51] The Citizens Foundation, "Training," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/Training_Evaluation.aspx.

[52] The education database will be structured similarly to the Multimedia Educational Resource for Learning and Online Teaching (MERLOT) website.
MERLOT, *Multimedia Educational Resource for Learning and Online Teaching*,
http://www.merlot.org/merlot/index.htm.

[53] Fair, *Islamic Education in Pakistan*, 8.
Pakistani parents are concerned that their children both receive an education and learn to be "good Muslims."

[54] The Citizens Foundation, "TCF Story."
The Citizens Foundation, "TCF Supporters," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/Supporters.aspx.

[55] Raffaello Pantucci, "The Jihad Will be YouTubed," *Foreign Policy: The AfPak Channel* (December 15, 2011), http://afpak.foreignpolicy.com/posts/2011/12/15/the_jihad_will_be_youtubed.
The Washington Post, "U.S. Military, Taliban Use Twitter to Wage War," *The Washington Post with Foreign Policy*, December 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/us-military-taliban-use-twitter-to-wage-war/2011/12/16/gIQAKnJ32O_story_1.html.
Merlyna Lim, "Islamic Radicalism and Anti-Americanism in Indonesia: The Role of the Internet," *Policy Studies* 18 (2005): 43, 45, 48, http://scholarspace.manoa.hawaii.edu/bitstream/handle/10125/3520/PS018.pdf?sequence=1.

[56] Susan Collins and Joseph Lieberman, *Violent Islamist Extremism, The Internet, and the Homegrown Terrorist Threat: Majority & Minority Staff Report,* Senate Committee on Homeland Security and International Affairs, 110th Cong., 2$^{nd}$ sess., (May 8, 2008), 3, 11, http://www.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a482218.pdf.
Max Entman, *Audio: Interview with Rick "Ozzie" Nelson on Homegrown Extremism*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (September 29, 2010), http://csis.org/multimedia/audio-interview-rick-ozzie-nelson-homegrown-extremism.

[57] Salman Masood, "Schools in Pakistan Closed in Wake of Attack," *The New York Times*, October 21, 2009, http://www.nytimes.com/2009/10/22/world/asia/22pstan.html.

[58] Lall, *Creating Agents of Positive Change*, 19.

[59] Ibid., 29.

[60] Bryan Gibel, "Pakistan: The Lost Generation: US Aid to Pakistan: The Kerry-Luger Bill," *Frontline World: Stories from a Small Planet*, PBS, http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/pakistan901/aid.html.

[61] Ibid.

[62] Farooq and Ziad, "The Battle for Pakistan's Soul."

[63] Ibid.

[64] Epstein and Kronstadt, *Pakistan: U.S. Foreign Assistance*, 8.

[65] Ibid., 9.

[66] The Citizens Foundation, "Our Schools," http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/schoolList.aspx.

[67] K. Alan Kronstadt, *Pakistan-U.S. Relations: A Summary* (Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, October 21, 2011), 2, 5, 7-9, 30-31, http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/row/R41832.pdf.
After the raid on Abbottad, many members of the U.S. Congress began to question why the United States should continue to send aid to a country that supports militant Islamic groups and where Osama bin Laden was able to live comfortably for several years. The United States also feels that Pakistan is not cooperative enough, given the amount of U.S. aid it receives.

[68] *Enhanced Partnership of Pakistan Act 2009*, S. 1707, 111th Cong., 1st sess., *Congressional Record* 155, no. 148 (October 15, 2009), http://www.govtrack.us/congress/bill.xpd?bill=s111-1707&tab=summary.

[69] Marian L. Lawson and Curt Tarnoff, *Foreign Aid: An Introduction to U.S. Programs and Policy* (Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, April 9, 2009), 9, http://fpc.state.gov/documents/organization/124970.pdf.

[70] Saleem, "Against the Tide," 71.
The Citizens Foundation, "Our Schools."
TCF schools have class and art rooms, administration rooms, a playground, library, and computer and science labs. Thus, TCF is able to construct and maintain these facilities for a year for less than $90,000.

[71] David B. Ottaway and Joe Stephens, "From U.S., the ABC's of Jihad: Violent Soviet-Era Textbooks Complicate Afghan Education Efforts," *The Washington Post*, March 23, 2002, http://www.washingtonpost.com/ac2/wp-dyn/A5339-2002Mar22?language=printer.
During the Cold War, the United States supplied Afghanistan with textbooks containing militant Islamic teachings.

[72] USAID Bureau for Policy and Program Coordination, *Strengthening Education in the Muslim World: Summary of the Desk Study*, Issue Paper No. 2 (Washington, DC: United States Agency for International Development, 2003), http://www.devtechsys.com/assets/Uploads/docs/publications/strengthening-education-in-the-muslim-world-summary.pdf.